

CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN

1

The Council convened a hybrid meeting at the Public Service Center, 1300 Franklin Street, sixth floor, Vancouver, Washington. Councilor Sue Marshall attended in person. Councilors Glen Yung, Michelle Belkot, Gary Medvigy, and Karen Bowerman attended via WebEx.

PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE AND RESILIENCY ELEMENT PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN

The Council considered a proposal to adopt a public participation plan, including a timeline and the process for formation of three advisory groups, to develop a Climate Change and Resiliency Element for the Comprehensive Growth Management Plan 2025-2045.

MARSHALL: I guess with that we are ready to move on to our second public hearing, Climate Change & Resiliency Element of the Public Participation Plan. Oliver and Jenna, thank you for being here and all your hard work to put this together.

ORJIAKO: Thank you, Councilors. Good morning and for the record we have our court reporter online so I will encourage folks who want to testify to also give their name and we don't require their address but their name is good enough.

Councilors, what we have this morning is a request for the Council to approve the Public Participation Plan for the County completing or including the climate change in our Comprehensive Plan document as part of the 2025 plan update.

Before I start or turn it over to Jenna, let me share with the Council

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

2

that we did receive comments internally as well as externally and we tried our best to incorporate those changes. Unfortunately we made those changes and posted it on our project web page yesterday.

And the revisions that we made were based on the comments that we received and our goal was to make the document much much clearer to read and to understand, but more importantly to provide a good Public Participation Plan where we have a good collaboration and listening to all of the parties of this bill is of importance too.

So the changes that we made was again to be very clear on what we intended to do and also to clarify that the Environmental Justice Coalition, which is known as EJC, the members of that can also apply to the Council to serve on the climate advisory committee, so there is no distinction, one individual can serve on both, we tried to clarify that. The way that the current PPP was written it wasn't very clear, so that's part of the changes that were made.

If the Council believe that those changes were not timely and wants to give the public the opportunity to comment on them, I will welcome if the Council wants to continue the hearing to a date certain, but I see that a lot of folks have submitted comments and are here in person to testify and I will encourage the Council to allow them to do so and then whatever the Council decides to do we will welcome that.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

3

So let me turn it over to Jenna to give the Council a very quick summary of what we did and what is it that we are proposing. I will also submit to Council with the assistance from the County Manager, we have submitted grant application to the State, that was submitted October 30th so we are waiting feedback from the State. Thank you, Councilors.

KAY: My name -- oh, okay. Good morning. For the record my name is Jenna Kay with Community Planning and as Oliver noted we are here to request approval of a Public Participation Plan for the new Climate Change & Resiliency Element for the Comprehensive Plan. Next slide.

Our presentation includes a brief overview on the purpose of the climate element project, an overview of the proposed Public Participation Plan and a timeline for the project work and engagement opportunities. Next slide. All right.

So we'll start with our quick review of the project. And with the passage of House Bill 1181 during the 2023 legislative session, Clark County is now required to add a Climate Change & Resiliency Element to its Comprehensive Plan by June 30th, 2025.

This work needs to integrate into the 2025 Comprehensive Plan periodic review project which is currently underway. And this slide

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

4

is showing the required Growth Management Act Comprehensive Plan element which now includes Climate on the list as well as optional elements in the County's plan. Next slide.

The new legislation requires that Clark County's climate element include a greenhouse gas reduction subelement and a resiliency subelement and this means that both topics will need to be added into the County's Comprehensive Plan including goals and policies for the County to implement during the 20-year planning period of 2025 to 2045.

The greenhouse gas subelement requires the County to identify actions it will take to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and vehicle miles traveled related to land use and transportation, and these actions must prioritize reductions that benefit overburdened communities to maximize co-benefits of reduced air pollution and environmental justice.

The main project tasks are listed on this slide and include baseline data collection, research and analysis which includes a greenhouse gas emissions inventory, selection of targets for greenhouse gas and vehicle mile traveled reduction, development of a goal and policy list which will ultimately come before Council consideration as part of the Comprehensive Plan.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

5

The resiliency subelement needs to identify goals and policies the County will pursue to equitably improve county resiliency to the impacts of climate change such as heat, flooding and wildfire smoke and this subelement requires prioritizing actions that benefit overburdened communities that will disproportionately suffer from the compounding environmental impacts and natural hazards due to climate change.

The main project tasks for this subelement are also listed on the screen and include foundational data collection, research and analysis such as an exploration of climate impacts, selection of priority climate hazards for the planning cycle, development of a goal and policy list which will ultimately come before Council for consideration as part of the Comprehensive Plan. Next slide.

So now we'll move to speaking about what's in the Public Participation Plan document itself. As you can see on this slide one of the Growth Management Act's 15 goals is for early and continuous Public Participation Plan -- or early and continuous public participation. Next slide.

And this Public Participation Plan or PPP provides members of the public opportunities for early and continuing participation as well as access to key decision-making processes with the Clark County Planning Commission and County Council. The PPP describes the steps

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

6

that the County will take to provide opportunities for public engagement as well as Clark County contact information and web addresses.

This PPP is slightly different than a typical project participation plan because the County Council already adopted a Public Participation Plan for the Comprehensive Plan periodic update in March of 2023, that took place before House Bill 1181 was passed into law.

So we view this PPP for the Climate Change & Resiliency Element as a supplement to that already adopted Public Participation Plan because this climate element work is also part of the Comprehensive Plan 2025 periodic update project and it's also addressing a significant change to the State's Growth Management Act.

There are three main goals in the proposed Public Participation Plan. The first is to communicate clearly. The second is to prioritize equity and this means that the County will incorporate the environmental justice and equity components of House Bill 1181 into its public process.

The third goal is to inform, consult, involve and collaborate meaning that the County will provide a process with a wide spectrum of options for education and feedback during the project from keeping the public

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

7

informed, making sure the project team listens and acknowledges what we hear.

And the project team will explain how public feedback impacts the project. And as much as possible the project team is going to be looking to community members for advice and innovation in formulating solutions. And our goal is to try to incorporate community member advice and recommendations into the final deliverable that we bring before you for County Council consideration.

We'd also like to acknowledge that much of the substance in this proposed Public Participation Plan is based on the work by JLA Public Involvement who conducted a climate stakeholder assessment for this project and we'll talk about that a bit more later in the presentation. Next slide.

The County plans to use a variety of communication tools and techniques to inform the public and encourage their participation. These include a project web page, an e-mail distribution list, media, written comments, Comprehensive Growth Management Plan 2025 periodic update, public engagement activities, as well as specific climate change and resilience public engagement activities that will include community led initiative.

The project team will communicate clearly and consistently using

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

8

plain language, translating and trans-creating materials into multiple languages and avoiding politically charged language as much as possible by describing things in factual and neutral terms.

There will also be public comment periods and hearings, a specific tribal engagement strategy, and the formation of advisory groups. And one approach with the advisory groups is to have them develop an equity framework early in the process to serve as a touchstone to guide the process in their decision-making -- to guide their process in decision-making to ensure they're being consistent with the equity goals in the legislation. Next slide.

So we mentioned that the County previously hired JLA Public Involvement who's a mutual consultant to consult -- excuse me -- to consult -- to conduct preliminary stakeholder interviews to learn about key climate change and resiliency issues in the unincorporated county and this is to better understand the range of perspectives in the community as well as to inform our public engagement strategy for this project and this document.

JLA prepared a climate stakeholder assessment summary that includes a summary of their approach and what they heard through their interviews and they also included recommendations regarding advisory group composition, formation, charge and group process. The project team plans to follow the recommendations in this report as much as

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

9

we can.

The first proposed advisory group is a Climate Community Advisory Group that would be appointed by the County Council to develop consensus-based goal and policy recommendations that would ultimately come before you for consideration to adopt as part of the Comprehensive Plan. As such, this group is recommended to represent a really wide range of interest within the community where there's also representation geographically from across the county amongst the group members.

JLA recommended the following position based on their assessment interviews, several representatives for environmental justice and vulnerable community members, urban area residents both renters and homeowners, rural area residents both renters and homeowners, sectors such as homebuilding, land development, the business community, affordable housing, transit users, commuters, the healthcare field, environment, education, youth, bike and pedestrian, agriculture and farming, forestry, freight, industry, economic and workforce development, and groups involved in outdoor activities.

In addition to these positions that would be voting positions in this group, we are also recommending that the County Council consider if they would like to identify a Council liaison who could attend these

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

10

meetings and participate as a nonvoting member but could keep the Council in the loop throughout the project.

ORJIAKO: Councilors, if I may, a Council liaison could come from Amber, the County Deputy Manager, it could come from the Senior Policy Analyst, if any Council member wants to be that kind of liaison, I will welcome that as well, that's what we are thinking about.

KAY: Okay. Next slide. The second group to support this project would be Environmental Justice Coalition. And the idea for this group is that the County would contract with local community-based organizations to help us with our community engagement to -- members of our community who are most vulnerable to climate pollution and the impacts from climate change. Contracting with Environmental Justice Coalition members would follow County purchasing and contracting procedures and policies.

Focused outreach would be conducted to organizations that were identified by JLA in their initial stakeholder assessment process and that includes organizations supporting communities such as culturally specific groups, minority-focused business, community development and service organizations, groups supporting immigrants and refugees, groups supporting black, indigenous and people of color, older adults, youth, early childcare or education providers, and groups supporting people who identify LGBTQ+, people living with

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

11

disabilities, people who are houseless and farm workers. Next slide.

And the third group formed to support this climate project would be an interdepartmental and interagency coordinating team assembled by Community Planning staff. This group would be like an extension to the county project team and likely include many of the primary implementers of what comes out of this work.

So staff would call on people in these organizations as needed throughout the project. And it's a very long list, but the agencies include all of the cities and towns in the county, most departments at the county, Cowlitz Indian Tribe staff, our local hospital and medical organizations, other government agencies that might intersect this work such as fire districts and the Port, next slide.

Several of our regional agencies such as the Conservation District and CRESA, the Wastewater District and CREDC, the Clean Air Agency, RTC, and the Workforce Southwest Washington, schools and educational organizations in the county, we may want to call on our State agencies if we need information as well, and then finally also our local utilities such as Northwest Natural and Clark Public Utilities. Next slide. Okay.

So to wrap up, we just want to review the project timeline. So today

CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN

12

is November 7th and we are requesting approval of the Public Participation Plan for the Comprehensive Plan climate element work.

If you approve the PPP, staff would then move forward to launch the process for people to apply to join the advisory groups we just described. We anticipate advisory group formation would wrap up in January with advisory groups beginning to meet by February and throughout 2024.

Also throughout the year we would be planning public engagement activities in the community where the feedback received would then feed back into the advisory groups processes. And by early 2025 we expect to have a complete draft of a climate element that would then move through the adoption process in the spring of 2025. And by State mandate the project has to be complete by June 30th, 2025.

My final two comments; one is that I think at last count I saw 11 public comments sent in for this hearing in writing. If you would like staff to respond to anything in those comments, please let us know, we are glad to speak on those.

And then, second, as Oliver mentioned at the beginning of this presentation, we did want to note that we did post an updated version of this Public Participation Plan on our website yesterday afternoon.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

13

While we, you know, view those edits as clarifying edits and not making substantial changes, we do also recognize that they're very last minute. And so if the Council would like to continue the public comment period so the public has more time to review those, we are supportive of that.

So I'm going to stop there and Oliver and I are glad to answer questions.

MARSHALL: Great. Thank you very much.

MEDVIGY: Chair.

MARSHALL: Let me open it up to Council. Is there anyone on the Council who have initial questions before we open the public hearing?

MEDVIGY: Yeah. So maybe you can't hear me. Can you hear me, Sue?

MARSHALL: Yes, you're coming in.

MEDVIGY: Okay. Thank you. So I would just harken back to Oliver's introductory comments. There's so much good work has gone into this by his staff, by the consultant, great comments input already by the public, but going back to Oliver's initial comments, Oliver, what is your recommendation?

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

14

Have you captured all of the good input of the public? Do we need time to ensure that we made necessary changes? You know, some of the comments were really public input on the plan itself and is really untimely.

But as far as public participation what is your recommendation? Have you captured all that you need to capture or do we need to delay to ensure that we've done so?

ORJIAKO: Good question, Councilor Medvigy. I believe that we have captured what we need to capture and the changes we need to make. And with that, it is really the desire of the Council, as Jenna indicated, if the Council wants to allow more opportunity for the public to comment on the changes that we made, I will welcome that, but I believe that we have thoroughly answered or incorporated the comments we received both internally and externally.

Some of the ones that are coming in today and throughout yesterday were very supportive of the document and the approach that we are taking and really asking for transparency and listening to the public and that is really what we strive to do.

I cannot emphasize enough that this particular bill is very complex. We will do our best to adhere to the letter of the law and what is required of us. At the end of the day you will have the opportunity

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

15

to hear from the public what is it that they're recommending and you will be the one making the final decision, but this is very challenging and we just want to go to work.

MARSHALL: Thank you.

MEDVIGY: Thank you.

MARSHALL: Any other comments or questions before we open the public hearing?

YUNG: If I may.

MARSHALL: Yes, go ahead.

YUNG: So thank you for clarifying that some changes were made and, you know, I'm in Japan right now so maybe I missed an e-mail, but this is the first that I've heard of those changes and I don't know, was an e-mail or something sent out that kind of clarified or maybe summarized some of those changes?

OTTO: Yes, there was an e-mail sent out to Council I believe yesterday that outlined the changes.

YUNG: Okay. I may have missed that one. The time it's now 4:45

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

16

in the morning, so time is also a challenge for me at the moment, but thank you for that, I will look into that.

That makes me a little bit hesitant to move forward without expanding the time given the fact that I've been unable to, you know, familiarize myself with those changes, I would imagine the public hasn't as well.

But I also had a question, you know, during my one-on-one with JLA, and it was probably a couple of months ago now, one of the things that I pointed out as most important to me, and I just received feedback as well from a constituent regarding this, is we have kind of these three groups that are going to be working together.

And first of all I hope that these groups are truly empowered to develop their own recommendation to us just with the guidance of staff. I know that often these groups can kind of be led to a conclusion. I don't think that that's staffs intention at all, but I think it does sometimes take place, so I'd want to empower them to really bring good ideas to us.

But the concern that I have is when you have three different groups which may be the best way to move forward with this, but how does the three of them collaborate because I don't want to end up in a situation where we have three different groups coming with three

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

17

different recommendations to us that have not been vetted amongst each other, that there's not been coordination between and communication and compromise.

I, you know, I really want to have one solid recommendation coming forward to the Council that we can, you know, review and discuss and, you know, it's when you end up with multiple groups that share different perspective, I think it's critical that those groups and their different perspectives be worked through together and not separate. So I'm wondering how this process is going to go about with that.

KAY: Yeah, I can speak to that. And I think in retrospect I probably shouldn't have described this as three different advisory groups because there's really only one group that will be making a recommendation to the Council and that's that Community Advisory Group that has the really wide range of interest.

So that's the group we are asking you all to appoint people to that will then present a recommendation that staff plan is to take the recommendation, put it in the, you know, into the Comprehensive Plan and then bring it to you, so that's the group that will be providing a recommendation.

The Environmental Justice Group they're, we are hiring them to help

CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN

18

us with our community engagement so we do a better job reaching people and that feedback will feed into that Community Advisory Group and members, you know.

Folks involved in the environmental justice work can also be members of that Community Advisory Group, but that I view -- I view the Environmental Justice Group as our public outreach arm but it will feed back into the Community Advisory Group.

And then the third group I mentioned about the interagency, inter-department group, I think we're just trying to show how complex and expansive this project is and the amount of people we as staff may need to call on to help us along the way, so I view that as, you know, that's like staff support, the extended staff support team on who we will consult with as-needed throughout the project.

So like I said, in retrospect we maybe should have presented it as one advisory group because it will only, you'll only be getting a recommendation from one group.

YUNG: Great. Thank you. That helps clarify. I, you know, look forward to seeing how this unfolds. It's going to be, I mean any time we have, and as an extensive of a process like this, it's going to be a challenge so I appreciate that.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

19

The one last comment that I had to make was I really want to stress and make sure that the people that are placed on to the committee really and truly represent that one particular group that they're applying for.

You know, I've been involved in groups in the past where, you know, people will yes they check the box for this but their real passion is this and so they get on the group for something that really isn't their passion and so you end up with multiple people on the group that share the same passion and it starts to tip the scale on the balance of the committee.

So I was curious how you intend to make sure that you get true representation from people that that really is their passion and that all of these groups are really well represented?

KAY: Yeah. I think we will try to be intentional in the application process on the, you know, the questions we ask and information we request for those interested in applying.

We also, I didn't say this, but it's in the Public Participation Plan, we are in the process of hiring some additional consultants and do plan to have neutral facilitators involved who will be supporting these groups and we would like them to review the applications to make a recommendation because they're really process experts at

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

20

helping groups build consensus and we would then take, present their recommendation to you for the appointment process. So we -- those are some of the things we have thought of so far on how we might do that.

YUNG: Great. Thank you. And then it kind of circles me back to one of my original comments is it's a delicate balance because the groups do need to be steered but not heavy handedly steered in my opinion.

They have to be able to make, you know, they have to be able to deliberate and come up with a solid recommendation for the Council that's not been directed and steered to heavy handedly. Thanks. Those are my comments.

MARSHALL: Thank you. Did you have additional comments?

ORJIAKO: No, that's our intent really to do that to strive to do that. I couldn't agree more but, yes, that's our intent to do so.

MARSHALL: Great. Councilor Belkot, did you have any comments at this time?

BELKOT: No, just that I mean this is a lot of work. I mean this is amazing how quickly this has all unfolded and it was really

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

21

interesting to talk to the consultants and participate in this and give my thoughts about all of this, it's just really, you all have done a lot of work so thank you for all your hard work with this.

MARSHALL: Thank you. I don't know if Councilor Bowerman is online at this time.

BOWERMAN: I am.

MARSHALL: Oh, did you have anything you would want to add at this moment before we open it up for public comments?

BOWERMAN: No, not really. I had said much the same thing that the Councilor did just a moment ago about the massive nature of this project and that the care with which it is coordinated is a very delicate balance and yet it is one that also needs structure to it (inaudible) lets it get out of hand and lets it go just every direction imaginable, so keep an eye on the nature of the coordination because that is I think where is the excellence of the product is going to come.

MARSHALL: Thank you. And just one comment, I received a couple of comments from constituents who they were wondering because not everything from the JLA report was reflected specifically in the PPP and so they were wondering for example like the group process, some

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

22

of the group process information, trust building and the spectrum of participation.

I know the recommendation was to work towards collaboration and I think that spectrum is really important for the participants to understand how that plays out so there's not -- often there can be frustration at the end that we thought we were advising on this and, no, it's really that.

So I think using that spectrum would be helpful and carrying forward a lot of the good advice that was developed in that consultant report is which I think you mentioned you were planning to do so. Thank you. Okay. I think we're ready to open the public hearing.

MESSINGER: Donald Steinke.

HOLLEY: Could you please make sure they spell their last name.

STEINKE: Is this on now? Yes. So my name is Don Steinke, S-t-e-i-n-k-e. I'm a retired physics teacher having taught in Clark County for 36 years. How's the volume, is that about right?

I'm a member of the Alliance for Community Engagement, an alliance of about ten environmental organizations in Southwest Washington. I applaud staff for their work responding to the climate amendment

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

23

of the Growth Management Act.

And the comments made in the last 20 minutes, there were four things that stuck out to me that I like. Get to work, steering the committees, we need to make sure that they are reminded at every meeting what the goal is and that, and they need to be -- another word that stuck out was informed, they all need to be informed about what the laws are, existing laws and what the various tools are. I got a long list of them which I sent to all you guys yesterday. And then I like the word structure because that helps you keep focused on what the goal is.

And those laws I mentioned most of those laws include equity as a primary thing, so the people on the committees need to know what the laws say about that equity. Like, well, I could tell you but we don't have time.

Regarding the timeline for the proposed Public Participation Plan it indicates that by early 2025 the advisory groups are supposed to submit a draft climate element to the Planning Commission for eventual adoption by you, and there are three huge topics that are missing from the conversation, and I almost think they're foundational to the work.

We need to stop increasing emissions. Before you can talk about

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

24

decreasing, we need to stop increasing them and we're increasing them with every decision we make practically.

The next topic that's missing is we need to build a lot of solar production in Clark County. The Washington State Department of Energy estimates that we need 22 gigawatts of renewal energy by 2035, that's about 1 gigawatt of solar in Clark County.

Also not mentioned is the unprecedented level of grant money available for clean energy projects. The problem is not a lack of money, the problem is that so much money is available that funds are likely be left on the table if we don't prepare and apply for them. It is of utmost importance that some staff time be allocated for grant writing. Thank you very much.

MARSHALL: Thank you.

MESSINGER: Richard Rylander.

RYLANDER: Are we on? Okay. Good morning. Good to see many of you again. I attempted to e-mail the Council just recently your .pdf document on the plan with the imbedded comments, I thought it was easier to put them all in. Unfortunately your server rejected it as spam. Consequently this morning I provided staff a copy of that .pdf document with comments.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

25

And there are so many comments, I spent hours on that report, and while I appreciate the attempt to deal with a myriad of legal as well as social and environmental issues, I have a significant number of concerns and issues that are in the report and there just is not time in three minutes to go into those to any depth or degree.

But I as to whether or not you have sufficient information to move forward and say put this plan into place or whether you want to take additional public comment, I have not seen the document that was released yesterday, so I can't comment or how it compares or not.

I would encourage you to give public some additional time for comments which hopefully would allow you to find a few minutes to look at the comments and the questions that I raised in the original document as well.

I actually perceive that in the document itself and the report from JLA that there are a number of inherent biases. I question their approach to the use of the snowballing technique in the initial input and the outcomes. There are so many details and pieces that cause me significant concern.

I also provided or will provide staff as well with a link to a new study on climate change that was just released in August. Over 1600

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

26

climate scientists around the world go into great depth and detail in discussing the comments about or the perceptions about climate change and the impact on society.

So I would just ask you to take a bit of additional time and dig in deeper and make sure that full public comments are available. Thank you.

MARSHALL: Just to let you know, we did receive your comments yesterday, so they were received.

RYLANDER: Oh, they were rejected.

MARSHALL: I think there was a subsequent e-mail that came in. Anyway, I took a look at them so thank you for that. And I know it's frustrating to keep this to three minutes because this is a large topic but be encouraged to write to us, you can set up meetings with us and there's a lot, this is a Public Participation Plan so there will be involved public participation opportunities. Okay.

MESSINGER: Diane Dempster.

DEMPSTER: I'm Diane Dempster. My last name is spelled D-e-m-p-s-t-e-r. I'm here on behalf of Friends of Clark County. Friends of Clark County supports the Public Participation Plan

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

27

outlined by Community Planning.

Creating sound and sustainable land use policies for a county rich with natural resources and incredible urban pressure is no easy task and we appreciate your efforts to preserve these precious resources and create a county that's livable for all.

We support the prevention of sprawl by encouraging development within the urban growth boundaries as stated in Goals 1 and 2 of the Act. Goal 8 specifically requires the County to encourage conservation of productive forestland and productive agricultural lands and discourage incompatible uses.

Prime farmland has been prime for development in the county for so long that much of our agricultural roots have been lost to development. Preservation of agriculture and agricultural lands is critical at this time especially as it relates to climate change.

A productive farming community adds to carbon sequestration and contributes less to greenhouse gases than do urban areas, it's also vital for the health of our community.

Increasing numbers of immigrants and underserved population suffer from diabetes and other food related diseases. A good supply of fresh and local fruits and vegetables can help remedy this. We

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

28

support the development of an ag- -- of the Community Advisory Group and encourage the inclusion of the agriculture community in this group.

Friends of Clark County supports the adoption of an agricultural commission that could represent the agriculture community in this group. We support the formation of the Environmental Justice Coalition that the staff recommends. It's vital to address food quality and food insecurity in these advisory groups.

And to quote a letter from the Washington State Food Policy Forum sent to the Department of Commerce, the pressure that climate change will enact on all food facets of our food system cannot be overstated.

The passage of House Bill 1181 provides a unique opportunity to review whether comprehensive plans have effectively planned for resilient food systems in the chase of space -- in the face of changing climate.

Thank you for your time and all the work on public participation and integrating the climate goals into the Comprehensive Plan.

MARSHALL: Thank you.

MESSINGER: Monica Zazueta. And speakers if you could please state your name and spell your last name, that would be great.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

29

ZAZUETA: Hello again. My name is Monica Zazueta. Last name is Z as in zebra, a as in apple, z as in zebra, u as in unicorn, e as in elephant, t as in tiger, a as in apple. I do that a lot on the phone. So I'm up here to thank everybody that was involved in this.

I was also involved in giving my input on creating this and I am very excited that we have this right now in front of us and I will be speaking about how we need to be moving from a degenerative design which is take, make, use, lose running down earth life supporting system and pushing us over planetary boundaries to regenerative which is restoring and working within the cycles of the living world and bringing us back within the planetary boundaries because nobody on the whole earth is doing that, so we need to do that here locally.

And with what the woman before me was saying about farming, I'm actually going to go back to college to become a farmer because I need my kiddos to know how to grow, harvest and make their own food because I'm not a good momma if I'm not doing that.

And so I really really strongly support this plan for community involvement and I really want more than just these groups involved, just going out and the second group that the woman was discussing about community outreach, like we need to actually have these people joining the meetings because that's how you get community together

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

30

so thank you so very much.

Oh, and my last thing that's on the back of my phone is my phone case it says no intelligent species would destroy their own environment. Duh. So thank you so very much and everyone take care.

MARSHALL: Thank you.

MESSINGER: Teresa Hardy.

HARDY: Teresa Hardy, H-a-r-d-y. I want to join in with those people who also appreciate all the work that's being done on this and realize that sometimes it's up to the last minute when things get put in, but as those of us that watch the agenda and what comes forward, we did just see there was information submitted late and we didn't see the public comment, so perhaps more time given to this would be helpful.

I am actually here speaking for Jim Byrne who is -- sent a comment in but was unable to attend. He is a long time resident of Clark County and is very knowledgeable about wetlands, water, fish, everything else around the environment. And he is in agreement with the three committees.

He does have a statement to make from about the JLA public involvement

CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN

31

in the process. They conducted surveys and interviewed county residents thought to be representative of all the residents and one thing that they discovered was public, state and -- public and stakeholders lack trust with the County and don't see it as transparent in its processes and projects, particularly related to diversity, equity and inclusion.

To guide committee decision-making it will be important to establish vision, goals and values for this effort as early in the process as possible and align them across each of the committees, and I think that's kind of what Councilor Yung was talking about. Trust needs to be built for open discussion and consensus to happen.

Some folks noted the polarizing positions suggest the meetings will need strong facilitation, clear agendas and goals. Some participants suggested specific alternatives for when consensus could not be reached such as public -- such as rank choice voting. It will be important to establish the vision, goals and values.

A common theme heard throughout -- recently the County has been failing in the trust department. Lack of enforcement of conditional use permits is a common theme.

Recently the actions of the PVJR railroad brought on more lack of confidence so I think moving forward it's trust, confidence and

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

32

feeling that it's more than just people talking that there really will be a difference because establishing a climate plan framework is crucial to, to the development of the county. Thank you.

MARSHALL: Thank you. Is there anyone else?

MESSINGER: I don't know if there's anybody else in the room, but we do have a caller or two. Caller, Heidi Cody.

CODY: Hello. Can you hear me?

MESSINGER: We can. Thank you.

CODY: My name is Heidi Cody, C-o-d-y. Thank you for creating a Public Participation Plan to incorporate a climate element into your Comprehensive Plan. Climate element is a crucial step that can help ensure responsible growth over the next 20 years.

I have a couple of suggestions about your public participation efforts in your special plan and in real life. Topic one, this has to do with the Public Participation Plan. In this version of -- in the version of the Public Participation Plan, Exhibit 1, that I read last week, there are no benchmarks or interim goals for lowering emissions.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

33

If you don't give your public participation committees goals to track and follow, they won't know how to proceed. I suggest using the Washington State targets for lowering emissions. And I did see in Jenna's presentation that adopting targets was part of that, so that was really good to see.

To ensure success with the Public Participation Plan only include people on your committee who believe in science and are willing to familiarize themselves with Washington State climate goals.

Topic two, this has to do with public participation in real life. Your meetings currently take public comments so late in the agendas that it makes it incredibly difficult to testify at these meetings. I would like to be there at that meeting today but I can't in person because I can't afford to take three to five hours away from my job to speak.

If you're interested in facilitating open participation by the public and testimony, please do two things. One, offer public comment about hearings at the top of your meetings. And, two, offer free public WiFi so that those of us who need to work can work while we wait to testify.

Topic three is Chelatchie Railroad. I support the residents along Chelatchie Railroad who are being bullied and bulldozed by Eric

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

34

Temple and PVJR. After receiving staff work orders from two to three separate agencies on October 23rd, Mr. Temple announced on November 5th that he's starting up his illegal, unpermitted work again.

You need to use your authority as a county to stop him. Use your Clark County Sheriff to enforce your county authority. By not getting work permits, PVJR breached the terms of the County's lease. The County should immediately terminate this lease with Eric Temple before PVJR drags the county further into its illegal activities. Thank you for your consideration.

MESSINGER: And it looks like we have another caller. Caller, please unmute yourself and go ahead with your comments.

GOHEEN-ELBON: This is Kimberlee Goheen-Elbon. So I'm not a professional speaker but with that said I'll say that I do give other points of view. Oliver is unelected and he believes he has captured public awareness, I disagree.

The Community Advisory Group is going to be appointing -- ask the Council to appoint those people. I believe that you're going to find, I find that disturbing and contradictory and in another way to lockout the citizens I'm trying to wake up. You will pick and choose those people that will be compliant to satisfy your agendas, and Mr. Yung skirted this issue in his remarks.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

35

I've complained numerous times that this Council and unelected staff are not actually making true efforts to involve the citizens of Clark County. If you were, there would be hundreds of concerned citizens involved. My duty is to try to wake up Clark County citizens to the real agenda.

To gain and use hard earned tax dollars and that's what you're doing, to use internally using the climate act, climate change, the American Reece Group plan, all of those, which makes for big government, big government our forefathers warned us about.

Many times on agendas Mr. Medvigy says that they pass millions and millions of hard earned tax dollars as they do pass that, that it's been in the works for years, numerous times he's mentioned this in different subjects that this has been going on for years. Well, so where are all the results of past hard earned tax dollars you received in those tax years?

Citizens need to do an audit of this Council. This three-year plandemic has allowed millions of hard earned tax dollars to be funneled internally with agendas such as the climate change. When citizens become aware of these fake agendas works which really we've polluted the heck out of the earth, we know that, but the way that they're doing it is, is actually kind of by using it for fake work within themselves. The public will and should be pissed off.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

36

So I ask citizens and this Council to get informed by looking at geoengineeringwatch.org. You concerned citizens need to look at the geoengineeringwatch.org and stop using the American Reece Group plan and the Growth Management Act both of which are criminal Biden's way to weaken America with internal spending at the expense of sounding like good efforts, yet again many years have passed knowing they are lining their pockets. Wake up Clark County citizens.

Also this Council will and are fixing the railroad system to mine 890 acres in Chelatchie Prairie cutting timber and then mining rock for the bridge and will put light rail over that bridge so that they --

MARSHALL: Thank you. Your time is up. Thank you.

GOHEEN-ELBON: My time is not up.

MESSINGER: I believe that's all we have.

MARSHALL: Okay. That's all we have. Thank you everyone for your comments. I'll turn it back to the Council if they or if the staff have anything they wanted to follow-up based on the comments of the public. So, Council, comments, questions?

MEDVIGY: So I would just say I'm in favor of approving the participation plan. There's no real rush though and I heard from

CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN

37

a number of people.

And I'm sorry your vacation has interrupted your ability to read your e-mails, Glen, but that's not really a real reason to delay, but I don't see any harm in delaying and the public wants to get caught up itself on the changes that were summarized in the e-mail that was sent out yesterday.

So, you know, at this point why rush it, let's come back to approve it after the public has had a chance to digest as well as all the Councilors.

MARSHALL: Other Councilors comments?

YUNG: One real quick question.

MARSHALL: Go ahead.

YUNG: Can somebody kind of outline the process for how the individuals will be selected and the approval process on that for the advisory groups. I apologize for not specifying that.

KAY: Sure. This is Jenna with Community Planning. And once the Public Participation Plan is approved, staff plans to open an application process where anyone in the county is welcome to apply

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

38

and they would identify which seat off of all of those on the list that's on the screen right now they're interested in serving in.

And once the application period closes, we would share those applications with our facilitation consultant who we'll hopefully have onboard by then, and they would review the applications and form a recommendation approve to appoint for the Community Advisory Group and that recommendation would come back to you all as Council for approval.

You would also get a copy of every single application received if you wanted to look very carefully at all of them, and so that is how the Community Advisory Group appointment process would work.

For the environmental justice group, we will be going through our standard procurement process for hiring outside organizations to help the County. So we envision these being small contracts, probably under \$10,000 for various organizations in the county.

So Community Planning we're actually going to get some help from Public Health staff to go through that contracting process, so we would -- there would be a public notification, any organization could apply and we will also make sure we notify those suggested in the JLA report on who we invite to apply for those contracts.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

39

And then for the third group, the, you know, various departments and other agency groups, we were planning that staff was just going to, that would be an internal staff, we would e-mail and make sure we understood who was on point for every organization and we would be in touch with them by e-mail as-needed throughout the project.

MARSHALL: Thank you. Anything else from you, Councilor Yung?

YUNG: Nope, not at this time.

MARSHALL: Councilor Belkot.

BELKOT: I'm okay with a slight pause if that's what we decide to do because obviously we have time, so I'm good either way with the pause or not. Those are my thoughts.

MARSHALL: Thank you. Councilor Bowerman.

BOWERMAN: I just would comment, I'm okay with the suggestion from Councilor Medvigy that the vote be postponed; however, I think that there will be so much time that lies ahead for all of us to absorb the many important comments that have been made particularly by Mr. Rylander as he reviewed so much of this documentation and made so many excellent comments.

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

40

So, therefore, I don't see the need to delay the vote for approval of a plan at this time and rather to ensure that the availability of those excellent documents that have been prepared are made available and referred to constantly so that we have them before us as further consideration are made by the various subgroups.

MARSHALL: Is there --

YUNG: I do have one more comment.

MARSHALL: Go ahead, Councilor Yung. Yep, go ahead.

YUNG: Yes. So in reference to the changes, so I appreciate the County Manager sending me the e-mail again and I did see that e-mail yesterday but it doesn't really do me very much good, you know, all it is is a link to the document saying that they've been updated and it's 101 pages, there's no way I can go through that 101 pages and compare it against my memory from a few days ago 101 pages to find those differences. So can we get a summary both for the Council and for the public, a summary of those changes.

OTTO: And, Councilor Yung, I do believe in the e-mail it stated the page number and the changes were made using track changes so you can actually see the edits.

CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN

41

MARSHALL: Okay. I think are we -- we would need a motion, and I don't know if it's to --

MEDVIGY: So, Sue, I'll make a motion to --

MARSHALL: Go ahead.

MEDVIGY: -- to delay, continue this hearing to a date specific that the Manager can schedule and Oliver can basically answering all the questions that from Dick Rylander to Glen Yung that are still outstanding. So a motion to continue this hearing to a date specific.

OTTO: And I would state the, I've been told that the date is November 28th is what would work best, so...

MARSHALL: November 28th. Okay. Is there a second to that motion?

BELKOT: I'll second that.

MARSHALL: Been moved and seconded. Any further comments? Do we need a roll call? No. Okay. All those in favor say aye.

BELKOT: AYE

BOWERMAN: AYE

**CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN**

42

MARSHALL: AYE

MARSHALL: That was three. Opposed no?

OTTO: Councilor Yung, I don't think we heard your vote.

MARSHALL: Maybe we do need to do a roll call.

YUNG: Can you hear me now?

MARSHALL: Oh, we can hear you now. How do you vote?

YUNG: Okay. That was an AYE

MARSHALL: Aye. Okay. Are we missing someone?

OTTO: Councilor Medvigy, I don't think we heard your vote as well.

MEDVIGY: Okay. Yeah, I had voted AYE

MARSHALL: Okay. Then it's unanimous. I appreciate your desire to get busy but a little bit of delay and then -- then you can get really busy. Thank you so much for all of your work and thank you Council.

CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL
VERBATIM TRANSCRIPT OF NOVEMBER 7, 2023
PUBLIC HEARING: CLIMATE CHANGE & RESILIENCY ELEMENT -
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN

43

CLARK COUNTY COUNCIL

Karen Dill Bowerman, Chair, District 3

Glen Yung, District 1

Michelle Belkot, District 2

Gary Medvigy, District 4

Sue Marshall, District 5

ATTEST:

Rebecca Messinger, Clerk to the Council

Minutes Transcribed by:
Cindy Holley, Court Reporter/Rider & Associates, Inc.

Rider & Associates, Inc.
360.693.4111